Inclusive tourism as a factor of sustainable development of the territories

*O.A. Kotlyarova**, *N.A. Nekhoroshikh*, *O.N. Povalyaeva*, and *M.A. Strelnikova*

FSBEI HE "Bunin Yelets State University", Kommunarov street, 28, 399770 Yelets, Russia

Abstract. The concept of the sustainable development has been a strategic goal of long-term global development over the past 20 years. The tourism industry is an important component of the sustainable development. The ideas of the sustainable development and sustainable tourism are the object of intense scientific interest and cause conflicting opinions regarding the viability and the possibility of practical implementation in reality. The implementation of the principles of the sustainable tourism is shown on the example of European countries and Russia. In Russia, both at the federal and regional levels, insufficient attention is paid to the problem of updating the principles of the sustainable tourism. UNWTO has formulated the priority goals for the sustainable tourism development, including a barrier-free tourism - ensuring safe and comfortable tourism for all holidaymakers, regardless of gender, race, physical disabilities, etc. The paper discusses some of the applied issues of the inclusive tourism; the experience of foreign countries is characterized; the trends of its development in Russia are determined. Despite the great opportunities for the development of the inclusive tourism in Russia, there are a number of problems, which include: underdeveloped infrastructure, low quality of services; lack of a barrier-free environment for people with disabilities.

1 Introduction

For the first time the idea of the sustainable development was voiced at the UN Conference on the Human Environment (Stockholm, 1972). This forum became the starting point for the further development of the idea and its transformation into the most important concept of the functioning of territories in a certain historical and cultural space of the regions of the world. Later this was more pronounced in the "World Conservation Strategy" (1980) report prepared under the auspices of the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN), the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) and the World Wildlife Fund (WWF). In 1991, its second edition appeared under the title "Caring for the Earth - a strategy for the sustainable life", where the concept of "sustainable" acquires scientific and applied features. In "Our Common Future" (1987) report of the International Commission on Environment and Development, a basic definition of "sustainable development" appears, which means meeting the needs of the present, but provided that this process does not harm future generations in terms of meeting new needs. Awareness of the continuity of "present-

* Corresponding author: okotlyarova_78@mail.ru

future" spatio-temporal categories is historically conditioned, and the emergence of a triune (society, economy, ecology) model of the sustainable development has become a natural step in the formation of a new understanding of the modern environment.

The next stage was the formation of a regulatory framework for the concept of the sustainable development, which by that time had already firmly entered the system of the national priorities in the developed countries of the world. Thus, at the UN Conference in Rio de Janeiro (1992), two main documents were adopted: the Declaration of Rio de Janeiro, which consisted of 27 principles, and the Agenda 21, in which contained a detailed plan of action to preserve the environmental safety in the countries of the world. Of course, this approach could not but entail the expansion of the area of practical action, and environmental problems began to be considered in the context of social and economic development. This was clearly indicated at the World Summit on Sustainable Development (Johannesburg, South Africa, 2002), in the adopted "Political Declaration". This document emphasized that "we (that is, the representatives of the peoples of the world) take on a collective responsibility for strengthening the interconnected and mutually supportive foundations of the sustainable development - economic development, social development and environmental protection - at the local, national, regional and global levels" [1].

Over the past twenty years, the concept of sustainable development has been relevant and often discussed at different levels: in the political, economic spheres, and the scientific community. The purpose of this article is to outline the content of the concept of the sustainable tourism in the context of the implementation of the idea of the sustainable development. An equally important and urgent problem is the use of the principle of inclusion in relation to tourist and recreational activities. In this paper, the inclusive tourism is considered within the framework of the strategic objectives of the sustainable tourism.

2 Methods

The methodological basis of the research was the modern philosophical provisions on the contradictory development of man and the structure of his activity; general scientific principles of the study of phenomena: scientific nature, logic, consistency, objectivity, connection between theory and practice;

Theoretical methods: research positions; conceptual and terminological analysis; systematic analysis served as a holistic consideration of the problem.

3 Discussion

In modern society, the processes associated with the effective functioning of a certain territory are influenced by a number of factors. They can be conditionally divided into socio-economic, historical, cultural, tourist and recreational ones. It is their ratio that determines the prospects for modern sustainable development of a particular region of Russia and the world. To highlight the main characteristics of such a development, it is necessary to carry out a comprehensive analysis of a certain territory and, on the basis of the data obtained, produce marketing analytics of destinations. Recall that tourism is a service sector that develops most significantly and dynamically, which determines the place of a specific historical and geographical object in the system of national and world historical and cultural values and prospects for socio-economic development. Today, tourism is an industry that is affected by many factors: globalization, the process of demographic aging, economic parameters, geographic conditions of the country, consumer contingent, etc. Its development is facilitated by opening of new directions and markets,

innovative activities in the service sector, as well as the level of the technological development [7].

In this regard, its tourist and recreational characteristic is becoming an important and sometimes a determining factor in the sustainable development of a territory. This is due to the fact that, firstly, tourism is one of the most dynamically developing sectors of the world economy (arguments). Secondly, tourism is an important, and the only source of growth in gross domestic product for some countries. Thirdly, the tourism sector directly or indirectly involves more than 60 industries and sectors of the regional economy in its turnover. Therefore, tourism has firmly entered the concept of the sustainable development of the territory, which is proved by the adoption back in 1996. UNWTO, the World Travel and Tourism Council and the Earth Council of the document Agenda 21 for the Travel and Tourism Industry, which can be considered fundamental in the development and implementation of the concept of the sustainable tourism development. This document provides the following definition of the sustainable tourism development: "The sustainable tourism development meets the current needs of tourists and host regions, protecting and enhancing the opportunities for the future. All resources should be managed in such a way that, while meeting economic, social and aesthetic needs, cultural integrity, important ecological processes, biodiversity and life support systems are preserved. The sustainable tourism products are the products that exist in harmony with the local environment, society, culture in a way that benefits rather than harms for the tourism development." This fact radically changes the views on tourism and on the positions of the participants in the tourism market. The main difference between the traditional and sustainable tourism is that in the latter one, the priority characteristic is the harmonization of environmental, socio-economic factors, while in traditional (mass) tourism, the main emphasis will be mixed on the economic component in the development of the industry. Such a lurch often led to the catastrophic consequences for the destination, and in accordance with this concept and the new needs of the society, the development of an innovative strategy in the activities of the state authorities and tourism enterprises became merely necessary. Thus, in 2004, the World Tourism Organization formulated the concept of the sustainable tourism development, the key points of which were: 1) the application of norms and practices for managing the sustainable tourism development in all forms; 2) spreading the principles of sustainability to the environmental protection, economic and socio-cultural aspects. In this regard, the main tasks of the sustainable development are to ensure the optimal use of the environmental resources, preservation of natural heritage and biological diversity; respect for the social and cultural characteristics of the host communities, preservation of cultural heritage. And, of course, ensuring the viability of the economic processes, taking into account their benefits for all stakeholders. The concept also stressed the need to strike a suitable balance between the above dimensions.

Thus, achieving the sustainable tourism is an ongoing process that requires the constant monitoring of the environmental impacts, introducing appropriate preventive and/or corrective measures, if necessary.

The next stage in the implementation of the principles of sustainability in tourism was the development of indicators for the sustainable tourism development, necessary for planning and managing this industry at various levels (national, regional, local). A number of policy documents and scientific papers are devoted to this topic, in which an active search for effective tools for monitoring the sustainability and the development of methodological principles of this concept in the scientific and practical plane is being conducted.

- Indicators of Sustainable Development for Tourism Destinations: a Guidebook, 2004;
- Making Tourism more Sustainable – a Guide for Policy Makers, 2005 [8].

The successful implementation of the projects on the sustainable tourism development

is demonstrated by Europe, where in 2003 the European Commission published Basic Orientations for the Sustainability of European Tourism: Invitation to Comment. They proposed for discussion the formulation of the main goals for the sustainable tourism development in Europe.

Scientific understanding of the concept of the "sustainable tourism" is also taking place in the academic environment, which indicates the need to create a modern methodological base for the study of the territory. Over the past 30 years, about 5 thousand papers have been published with the results of international and national research on the tourism sustainability. They show a tendency to differentiate between two concepts: "sustainable tourism" and "sustainable tourism development" [7]. According to experts, the concept of "the sustainable tourism has developed in parallel, but separately from the original paradigm of the sustainable development." This is due to the different semantic content of the category of "uniqueness" of the territory in the historical, cultural and socio-economic plane. Much of modern research continues to be shaped by this distinction. In this paper, we prioritize the sustainable tourism based on the well-founded rationale that achieving the sustainable tourism will inevitably contribute to the sustainable development. Another argument in favor of this term is that it is notable that the United Nations has declared 2017 as the International Year of Sustainable Tourism for Development, not Tourism for Sustainable Development.

Let's try to consider the problem from a regional perspective. Tourism plays an important economic role in the process of the sustainable regional development, helping to develop the regions with low growth rates. A common problem today is the lack of a quality database, which makes it difficult to quantify the sector's performance. Monitoring and quantifying the tourism results is a very complex process. Another problem is the creation of national and international comparative indicators that inform about the level of the sustainable tourism [7].

In this regard, the question of how the ideas of the sustainable tourism development are implemented in the conditions of Russian reality is quite natural. In the field of state regulation of tourist activity, this concept has not yet found its application and is practically not reflected in the program documents that determine the present and future of the domestic tourism. So, in the "Strategy for the development of tourism in the Russian Federation for the period until 2020", approved by the Order of the Government of the Russian Federation dated May 31, 2014 No. 941-p, the term "sustainable development of tourism" is absent, but it is noted that tourism can be a factor in the sustainable development of the regional economy" [4].

In March 2018, parliamentary hearings were held on "Legal and organizational issues of the sustainable development of domestic, inbound tourism in the Russian Federation." The main subject of discussion was the general problems of the industry: the need to improve the legal framework, issues of improving the safety of tourism, the use of a cluster approach in the development of the tourism industry, etc. It was noted that the current stage of the strategic tourism planning is associated with increased attention to the issues of the sustainability of the industry. For this purpose, it is necessary to develop measures to stimulate the use of resource-saving and eco-technologies at tourism infrastructure enterprises. In this vein, the tasks were set for the formation of the regional strategies in the field of tourism, taking into account the following important points:

- unlimited long-term use of tourist resources without losing their quality;
- ensuring the preservation of natural, social and cultural diversity;
- careful planning, an integrated approach, integration of tourism into the regional development plans;
- support of the regional economy, participation of the local population in the development of tourism and obtaining financial and other benefits from this activity.

Let us consider how the principles of the sustainable tourism development in the context of the international and state decisions are reflected in regional tourism development programs. On the example of the Lipetsk region, which is part of the Central Federal District of the Russian Federation, one can find only an indirect influence of these trends. The main program document that determines the development of tourism in the Lipetsk region is the Strategy for the socio-economic development of the Lipetsk region for the period until 2024, adopted by the resolution of the Lipetsk Regional Council of Deputies dated December 19, 2006 No. 60-пс" [2].

The following are identified as priority areas for the development of the industry:

- promotion of the tourism potential of the Lipetsk region at the international, all-Russian and interregional levels;
- popularization of the tourism potential of the Lipetsk region on the Internet;
- development of event tourism;
- development of regional identity of the Lipetsk region;
- development of special economic zones of tourist and recreational type and tourist clusters;
- support of the non-profit sector in the field of culture in order to develop competition and improve the quality of services.

As you can see, these directions do not correspond to the key positions of the sustainable tourism, but are focused mainly on the general trends of mass, traditional tourism.

The document defines the indicators of the Strategy, including those of the field of recreation and tourism.

Indicator 1. Provision of the population with cultural and leisure-type institutions, the number of institutions per 1000 inhabitants

Indicator 2. The volume of internal and inbound tourist flow in the region, thousand people

Indicator 3. Number of citizens of the Russian Federation and foreign citizens accommodated in collective accommodation facilities, thousand people

As we can see, these indicators can hardly be considered as those of the sustainable tourism development. Here we can agree with the opinion of a number of the researchers [3] that the sustainable tourism development presupposes the existence of a certain system of territorial (regional) management, while the indicators used in the targeted tourism development programs reflect only quantitative growth in the tourism infrastructure and do not relate to the regional system of the tourism management.

The question arises: can "sustainable tourism" exist and be implemented in practice in the absence of management and legislative frameworks? Or did it arise as an idea-alternative to mass tourism, more precisely, its negative consequences, and, in fact, is not viable (Sharpley, Richard)? The answer to proving the feasibility of this global initiative can be the emergence and development of types of tourism that reveal and promote the essence of the idea of the sustainable development. One of these types of tourism is the inclusive tourism.

Currently, the inclusive tourism is developing with varying degrees of intensity in various countries of the world.

The actively developing areas of this type of tourism now include New Zealand, Australia, Canada, Singapore, South Africa, China and European countries.

The most successful experience is in organizing and conducting travel for people with special needs in the EU. Among European countries, the leadership in this segment of the tourism sector is currently occupied by Great Britain, France and Spain. Considerable attention is paid to the development and promotion of this industry in Europe at all levels:

from the pan-European level, represented by the European Commission, to the level of individual studies by various scientists (J. Boutell [5], D. Bougalis [6] et al).

Back in 2010, the European Union proclaimed the development of the inclusive tourism as one of the priority areas for increasing competitiveness in the global market for goods and services produced on its territory. Promotion of this direction of the tourism sector, as noted by European researchers and officials, will help reduce the factor of "seasonality" in attracting travelers, reaching a larger number of people who wish, as the tendency of population aging is growing, an increase in the number of people with disabilities (both temporary and permanent ones), improving the quality of services provided and, in general, the sustainability of the tourism development.

As the experience of the development of the inclusive tourism in Europe shows, the prosperity of this direction is associated not only with the provision of a wide range of high-quality services for people with special needs by all leading European tour operators, an accessible environment covering almost 100% of the country's infrastructure, a developed transport system, but also targeted support on the part of the state of this particular segment of the tourism industry, from regulations and conducting relevant research on the problem under consideration at the expense of the state funds to encouraging organizations and people involved in this area. For example, in the UK, which is the leader in the inclusive tourism market in Europe, the Equality Act was adopted in 2010, which enshrines the systematic state support for this direction of tourism. Also, the national tourism administration VisitBritain was created, which contributes to the implementation of a set of measures for the development of the inclusive tourism in the country. The main areas of support are associated with the information services of the relevant tourist routes and advertising of tour operators, with the preparation of highly qualified personnel required for this segment, with a developed system for assessing the level of accessibility of facilities, with incentives in various forms involved in the field of inclusive tourism, with monitoring the market and the quality of services provided for persons with special needs.

The experience of developing inclusive tourism in Russia is not so successful. It is at the initial stage and is only now being formed. So far, this is of a fragmentary nature, and it is still impossible to speak of a systematic approach to its development.

On the Russian tourist market, you can find various types of offers for people with disabilities, these include: travel for the disabled; paratourism; wheelchair tourism; tourism for disabled people; tourism for the deaf; tourism for the blind; rehabilitation tourism; correctional and educational tourism.

At the federal level, there is "Accessible Environment 2011-2020" state program. It was adopted with the aim of creating a legal, economic and institutional environment conducive to the integration of persons with disabilities into society and improving their standard of living. But, unfortunately, we observe that it has not been fully implemented. In 2019, our country developed the Concept of the Federal Target Program for the Creation of Tourism Clusters. Its implementation provides for an increase in the level of implementation of a barrier-free environment at tourist industry facilities through the creation of the appropriate infrastructure.

The most developed directions for the dissemination of the inclusive tourism in the Russian Federation are Moscow, St. Petersburg and Sochi (within the framework of the Olympics).

More experienced and professional travel agencies in our country that provide the services for people with special needs are Liberty (St. Petersburg), Paralys-Invatour (Moscow), WELL Agency (Moscow). They carry out tourist trips both to the sights of Russia and to other countries. Some leading Russian tour operators, such as Coral-travel, Mostrevel, Amadel Tour, help to purchase the tickets with the significant discounts.

"Liberty" travel agency (St. Petersburg) is a specialized travel company for the wheelchair users, which implements only domestic the routes, but also the foreign ones. But the range of the travel services it provides is much wider than that of other travel agencies. It has the tour packages based on the priorities of the customer - it can be a beach vacation, and travel around the country, and ski tours, and spa tours, and dolphin therapy, etc.

"Invatur" National Center for Tourism for Disabled People (Moscow) has been successfully operating since 2005 and has organized the excursions around Moscow, the Moscow region, group tours to St. Petersburg, along the Golden Ring, as well as to Turkey, Greece, and the USA. It ceased to exist in 2016.

4 Conclusion

The result of this work was the consideration of the concepts of "sustainable development", "sustainable tourism", "inclusive tourism" in their interdependence. The implementation of the principles of the sustainable tourism in the Russian Federation is at its initial stage. And in this regard, serious steps are needed in the formation of a world outlook consistent with the declared set of UN documents, as well as in state support for the concept. One of the main factors constraining the competitiveness of Russia's position in the international tourism market is insufficient understanding and consideration of the global processes of the sustainable development. For the successful development of any tourist destination at the present stage, it is necessary to implement the principles of the sustainable development, to take into account the peculiarities of creating an environment where it would be comfortable for both the local community and the tourists. "Accessible Environment 2011-2020" state program is in line with the global trends of the sustainable development and, in particular, the sustainable tourism. Solving the problems of creating a barrier-free environment on the territory of the Russian Federation is the key to the successful development of the inclusive tourism, which is one of the factors of the sustainable development of the territories.

References

1. UN Official Website, <http://www.un.org/>
2. Law of the Lipetsk region dated December 25, 2006 No. 10 - O3 "Strategy of socio-economic development of the Lipetsk region for the period until 2024 (with amendments and additions), <http://base.garant.ru/>
3. M.M. Romanova, Scientific Bulletin of MGIIIT, **5(55)**, 18 (2018)
4. Strategy for the development of tourism in the Russian Federation for the period up to 2020, <https://www.russiatourism.ru/>
5. J. Bowtell, Journal of Tourism Futures, **1(3)**, 203 (2015)
6. D. Buhalis, V. Eichhorn, E. Michopoulou, G. Miller, European Network for Accessible Tourism, <http://www.accessibletourism.org/>
7. B. Gavurova, L. Suhanyi, M. Rigelsk, Entrepreneurship and sustainability issues, **8(1)**, 983
8. Making Tourism More Sustainable – A Guide for Policy Makers, 210, 11 (2005)
9. R. Sharpley, Journal of sustainable tourism, **28(11)**, 1932 (2020)